

Yechaveh Da'as Comments on Haichah Kedushah (Abbreviated Kedushah)

Yechaveh Da'as, chelek 5, siman 12, page 48, regarding whether it is OK to do what we call Haichah (abbreviated) kedushah (shliach tzibur recites only the first 3 brachos of Shmoneh Esreh aloud and kidush, and recites the rest quietly. The source for repetition of Shmoneh Esreh is in Mseches Rosh Hashan 34B. The Rambam explains that the repetition helps only those who **don't** know to say it themselves, and this is also stated in Yersushalmi Mseches Brachos perek 3, halach 3 regarding Meseches Rosh Hashah 29A. A chazan repeating Maariv Shmoneh Esreh would not motzi anyone, because Maariv Shmoneh Esreh is not chovah and thus not eligible for motzi yedai chovaso, and therefore repeating Maariv Shmoneh Esreh would be a bracha levatolo. The last 2 lines of page 49 state: "any takana that chazal established for some reason is established forever, even if the reason for the takana no longer applies." and the shliach tzibur should repeat Shmoneh Esreh even if everyone in the room is baki because lo nitnu chachamim divraihem lshiurim. Starting in the last paragraph of page 50, Ychaveh Daas explains that Rambam states in a teshuva that we should abolish the full repetition and instead everyone should pray along with the shliach tzibur through Kedusha (i.e. Haichah Kedushah) to avoid the prevalent talking during davening, and Rambam's son Avraham wrote that this was the minhag in Egypt during Rambam's generation and the next generation. And Rashbash agreed to this minhag. But the Rambam in a different teshuvah, written in Arabic, wrote that his recommendation for Haichah Kedushah applies only to Shabos and holidays, but not during ymai hachol because the congregants tend to listen to the repetition more during the ymai chol. The Radvaz wrote that Rambam's recommendation to shorten the repetition was only meant to apply to his time. Similarly, the Chasam Sofer wrote that Rambam's recommendation for Haichah Kedushah was only meant to apply to his place (Egypt) and his time. Many poskim require the full repetition no matter what, but others (Mashash, P'ulas Tzadik, Hashamayim Hachadashim, Kiras Chanah David) paskin to shorten the repetition where the congregants will be talking during the repetition.